

ITEM NO.1      Court No.1 (Video Conferencing)      SECTION PIL-W

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s). 4677/1985

M.C.MEHTA

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

((1) IA NOS.2722/2016, 2723/2016, 2724/2016 AND IA NO. 5075/2021 (APPLNS. FOR PERMISSION, DIRECTIONS, PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS ON BEHALF OF MINISTRY OF CULTURE AND ANOTHER), (2) IA NOS. 98587/2020 AND 98588/2020 (APPLNS. FOR INTERVENTION AND DIRECTIONS ON BEHALF OF RESIDENT WELFARE ASSOCIATION, RANGPURI EXTENSION) AND (3) I.A. NOS.161831/2019 AND 96210/2020 (APPLNS. FOR DIRECTIONS AND BRINGING ON RECORD ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS ON BEHALF OF DEFENCE COLONY MARKET WELFARE ASSOCIATION) IN W.P. (C) NO. 4677/1985 "ONLY" ARE LISTED : NAMES OF FOLLOWING ADVOCATES MAY BE TREATED TO HAVE BEEN SHOWN IN THE LIST : MR. S GURU KRISHNA KUMAR, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.) MS. ANITHA SHENOY, SR. ADVOCATE (A.C.) MR. A.D.N. RAO, ADVOCATE (A.C.) PETITIONER-IN-PERSON MR. B.V. BALRAM DAS, MR. PRAVEEN SWARUP, MS. GARIMA PRASHAD, MS. ANIL KATIYAR, MR. D.N. GOBURDHUN, MR. RAJ BAHADUR YADAV, MS. ROOH-E-HINA DUA, ADVOCATES )

Date : 03-02-2021 These applications were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.S. BOPANNA  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE V. RAMASUBRAMANIAN

Counsel for the parties

Mr. S Guru Krishna Kumar, Sr. Adv. (A.C.)

Ms. Anitha Shenoy, Sr. Adv. (A.C.)

Mr. A.D.N. Rao, Adv. (A.C.)

Petitioner-In-Person

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, LD ASG

Ms. DL Chidananda ,Adv.

Ms. Suhasini Sen, Adv.

Mr. SS Rebello, Adv.  
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.  
Mr. Rajesh Kr. Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, Adv  
Mr. G. S. Makker, AOR

Mr. B.V. Balram Das, AOR

Mr. Sanjiv Sen, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR  
Mr. Ameet Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Kanishik Chaudhary, Adv.  
Ms. Pareena Swarup, Adv.  
Mr. Soumo Palit, Adv.

Ms. Garima Prashad, AOR  
Mr. G.S. Oberoi, Adv.

Ms. Anil Katiyar, AOR

Mr. D.N. Goburdhun, AOR  
Mr. Alok Gupta, Adv.  
Ms. Pallavi Chopra, Adv.

Ms. Gauri Goburdun, Adv.

Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR

Mr. Sidharth Luthra, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Abhimanyu Bhandari, Adv.  
Ms. Roohe Hina Dua, AOR  
Mr. Cheitanya Madan, Adv.  
Ms. Rooh-E-Hina Dua, AOR

Mr. P.S. Narasimha, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. N.K. Mody, Sr. Adv.  
Mr. Chirag Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Vertika Sharma, Adv. (Mentioned IAs)  
Mr. Mayur Srivastava, Adv.  
Mr. Rajiv Kumar, AOR

Ms. Christi Jain, Adv. (mentioned IA)  
For Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR

Mr. Nishit Agrawal, AOR (mentioned IA)

Dr. Surender Singh Hooda, AOR  
M/S. Parekh & Co., AOR  
Ms. Manju Jetley, AOR  
Mr. Harish Pandey, AOR  
Ms. Anu Gupta, AOR  
Mr. V. K. Verma, AOR

Mr. Satish Aggarwal, AOR  
Mr. Pranaya Kumar Mohapatra, AOR  
Mrs. Rekha Pandey, AOR  
Ms. Sharmila Upadhyay, AOR  
Mr. Pravir Choudhary, AOR  
Mr. Ajit Sharma, AOR  
Ms. Prerna Mehta, AOR  
Mr. Satyendra Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Sanjeev Anand, AOR  
Mr. Md. Farman, AOR  
Mr. Prashant Chaudhary, AOR  
Mr. Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, AOR  
Mr. Suresh Chandra Tripathy, AOR  
Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR  
Ms. Uttara Babbar, AOR  
Mrs. Amita Gupta, AOR  
Mr. Abhay Kumar, AOR  
Ms. Ruby Singh Ahuja, AOR  
Mr. P. Parmeswaran, AOR  
Mr. Venkateswara Rao Anumolu, AOR  
Mr. Nikilesh Ramachandran, AOR  
Mr. Praveen Swarup, AOR  
Mr. Abhijit Sengupta, AOR  
Mr. Devendra Singh, AOR  
Mr. Neeraj Kumar Gupta, AOR  
Mr. Ravi Kumar Tomar, AOR  
Mr. Tarun Johri, AOR  
Mr. D. N. Goburdhan, AOR  
Mr. Avinash Kr. Lakhpal, AOR  
Mr. Gunnam Venkateswara Rao, AOR  
Mr. B. V. Balaram Das, AOR  
Mr. Sanjay Kapur, AOR  
Ms. Binu Tamta, AOR  
Mr. Sudhir Naagar, AOR  
Mr. T. L. Garg, AOR  
Mr. A. Venayagam Balan, AOR  
Mr. Shiv Prakash Pandey, AOR  
Mr. Avijit Bhattacharjee, AOR  
Mr. Ashwani Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Shekhar Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Annam D. N. Rao, AOR  
Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR  
Mr. Yashraj Singh Deora, AOR  
Mr. Senthil Jagadeesan, AOR  
Mrs. Rachana Joshi Issar, AOR  
Mr. Himinder Lal, AOR  
Ms. Rukhsana Choudhury, AOR  
Mr. Harsh V. Surana, AOR  
Mr. Raj Kamal, AOR  
Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR  
Mr. Arvind Gupta, AOR  
Mr. Nishit Agrawal, AOR  
Mr. Abhas Kumar, AOR

Mr. Milind Kumar, AOR  
Mr. Prashant Bhushan, AOR  
Ms. Rooh-e-hina Dua, AOR  
Ms. Kaveeta Wadia, AOR  
Mr. Arvind S. Avhad, AOR  
Mr. Ajay Kumar Singh, AOR  
Mr. Vivek Narayan Sharma, AOR  
M/S. M. V. Kini & Associates, AOR  
Mr. Udit Singh, AOR  
Mr. Yoginder Handoo, AOR  
M/S. Unuc Legal Llp, AOR  
Mr. Jasmeet Singh, AOR  
Mr. Gagan Gupta, AOR  
Ms. Akriti Choubey , AOR  
Mr. Rajivkumar, AOR  
Mr. Prakash Ranjan Nayak, AOR  
Mr. Dinesh Chandra Pandey, AOR  
Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR  
Mr. Gaurav Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Rahul Narayan, AOR  
Ms. Pratibha Jain, AOR  
Mr. Alok Gupta, AOR  
Mr. Mritunjay Kumar Sinha, AOR  
Mr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, AOR  
M/S. Karanjawala & Co., AOR  
Mr. Rajat Joseph, AOR  
Mr. Dhananjay Garg, AOR  
Mr. Ravinder Kumar Yadav, AOR  
Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR  
Mr. Shekhar Prit Jha, AOR  
Mr. S. S. Shroff, AOR  
Mr. Gaurav Goel, AOR  
Mr. O. P. Bhadani, AOR  
Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR  
Mr. Amarjit Singh Bedi, AOR  
Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR  
Mr. Vijay Panjwani, AOR  
Mr. Anand Mishra, AOR  
Mr. Ramesh Kumar Mishra, AOR  
Ms. S. Janani, AOR  
Mr. Firdouse Qutb Wani, AOR  
Mr. Ashok Anand, AOR  
Mr. Naveen R. Nath, AOR  
Ms. Garima Prashad, AOR  
Mr. Vishnu Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Prithu Garg, AOR  
Mr. M. M. Kashyap, AOR  
Ms. K. V. Bharathi Upadhyaya, AOR  
Mr. Karunakar Mahalik, AOR  
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR  
Ms. Rajani Ohri Lal, AOR  
Mrs. Gargi Khanna, AOR  
Mr. Rakesh Mishra, AOR

Mr. M. P. Shorawala, AOR  
Mr. A. Raghunath, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R

IA NOS.2722/2016, 2723/2016, 2724/2016 AND IA NO.5075/2021 - (APPLNS. FOR PERMISSION, DIRECTIONS, PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS ON BEHALF OF MINISTRY OF CULTURE AND ANOTHER) IN W.P. (C) NO. 4677/1985

At the request of Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, learned Additional Solicitor General, list the instant interlocutory applications after two weeks.

I.A. No.5075/2021 stands disposed of accordingly.

IA NOS.98587/2020 AND 98588/2020 - (APPLNS. FOR INTERVENTION AND DIRECTIONS ON BEHALF OF RESIDENT WELFARE ASSOCIATION, RANGPURI EXTENSION) IN W.P. (C) NO. 4677/1985

Issue notice returnable after two weeks.

Reply affidavit, if any, be filed by the respondents in the meantime.

I.A. NOS.161831/2019 AND 96210/2020 (APPLNS. FOR DIRECTIONS AND BRINGING ON RECORD ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS ON BEHALF OF DEFENCE COLONY MARKET WELFARE ASSOCIATION) IN W.P. (C) NO. 4677/1985

Mr. P.S. Narasimha, learned Senior Counsel appearing for the applicant - Association, states that there are many shops which have been purchased by the owners for commercial use, but these have been sealed by the Monitoring Committee on the ground that there is an unauthorised and illegal diversion of the user of the shops. The allegation of unauthorised use is that the premises which have been sealed, were originally purchased as residential units and have now been unauthorisedly converted to commercial use.

It is pointed out by Mr. Narasimha, learned Senior Counsel, on the bases of Certificate of Sale [Lease Hold Properties) issued under Rule 90(15) [Annexure - 4 at page 30 of the instant application) that the premises were original purchased as a shop. Further the notice for the auction held on 20.11.1957, shows that 14 shops in Defence Colony were meant to be auctioned.

If it is a fact that the premises which have been sealed on the ground of unauthorised change of user from residential to commercial, was actually sold as a shop, we see no reason why the sealing should continue.

However, it is important to ascertain which of the premises which have been sealed were originally purchased as shops meant for commercial use. We accordingly consider it appropriate to direct that a list be prepared of all such premises which were originally purchased as shops and have now been sealed on the ground that residential premises have been converted unauthorisedly to commercial premises.

Mr. A.D.N. Rao, learned Amicus Curiae, will scrutinize all the relevant documents regarding the original purchase of the premises.

Mr. Sanjiv Sen, learned Senior Counsel appearing for the South Delhi Municipal Corporation (SDMC), seeks permission to point out such documents which will show the true status of the shops in question when they were purchased.

We permit the South Delhi Municipal Corporation (SDMC) to do so.

Since the matter affects the livelihood of the members of the applicant-Association, Mr. Rao, learned Amicus Curiae may submit his report to this Court within a period of four weeks from today.

List the instant interlocutory application along with the above report and I.A. Nos. 108457/2020, 96784/2020, 96785/2020 and 78530/2020 in Writ Petition (C) No. 4677/1985 after four weeks.

(SANJAY KUMAR-II)  
ASTT. REGISTRAR-cum-PS

(INDU KUMARI POKHRIYAL)  
ASSISTANT REGISTRAR